



Serial: RNP-RA/09-0114

JAN 05 2010

Attn: Document Control Desk  
United States Nuclear Regulatory Commission  
Washington, DC 20555-0001

H. B. ROBINSON STEAM ELECTRIC PLANT, UNIT NO. 2  
DOCKET NO. 50-261/LICENSE NO. DPR-23

LICENSEE EVENT REPORT NO. 2009-003-00  
MANUAL REACTOR TRIP DUE TO FAILURE OF  
'A' STEAM GENERATOR LEVEL CONTROL MODULE

Ladies and Gentlemen:

The attached Licensee Event Report is submitted in accordance with the requirements of 10 CFR 50.73. Should you have any questions regarding this matter, please contact Mr. C. A. Castell at (843) 857-1626.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads 'W Scott Saunders'.

W. Scott Saunders  
Plant General Manager  
H. B. Robinson Steam Electric Plant, Unit No. 2

WSS/ahv

Attachment

c: L. A. Reyes, NRC, Region II  
T. J. Orf, NRC, NRR  
NRC Resident Inspector

Progress Energy Carolinas, Inc.  
Robinson Nuclear Plant  
3581 West Entrance Road  
Hartsville, SC 29550

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads 'IE22 NRR'.

**LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER)**(See reverse for required number of  
digits/characters for each block)

Estimated burden per response to comply with this mandatory collection request: 80 hours. Reported lessons learned are incorporated into the licensing process and fed back to industry. Send comments regarding burden estimate to the Records and FOIA/Privacy Service Branch (T-5 F52), U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission, Washington, DC 20555-0001, or by internet e-mail to [infocollects@nrc.gov](mailto:infocollects@nrc.gov), and to the Desk Officer, Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs, NEOB-10202, (3150-0104), Office of Management and Budget, Washington, DC 20503. If a means used to impose an information collection does not display a currently valid OMB control number, the NRC may not conduct or sponsor, and a person is not required to respond to, the information collection.

**1. FACILITY NAME**

H. B. Robinson Steam Electric Plant, Unit No. 2

**2. DOCKET NUMBER**

05000261

**3. PAGE**

1 OF 4

**4. TITLE**

Manual Reactor Trip Due to Failure of 'A' Steam Generator Level Module

5. EVENT DATE			6. LER NUMBER			7. REPORT DATE			8. OTHER FACILITIES INVOLVED																																		
MONTH	DAY	YEAR	YEAR	SEQUENTIAL NUMBER	REV NO	MONTH	DAY	YEAR	FACILITY NAME	DOCKET NUMBER																																	
11	06	2009	2009	003	00	01	05	2010		05000																																	
9. OPERATING MODE  1			11. THIS REPORT IS SUBMITTED PURSUANT TO THE REQUIREMENTS OF 10 CFR §: (Check all that apply)																																								
			<table border="0"><tr><td><input type="checkbox"/> 20.2201(b)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(3)(i)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(i)(C)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(vii)</td></tr><tr><td><input type="checkbox"/> 20.2201(d)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(3)(ii)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(ii)(A)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(viii)(A)</td></tr><tr><td><input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(1)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(4)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(ii)(B)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(viii)(B)</td></tr><tr><td><input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(2)(i)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> 50.36(c)(1)(i)(A)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(iii)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(ix)(A)</td></tr><tr><td><input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(2)(ii)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> 50.36(c)(1)(ii)(A)</td><td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(iv)(A)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(x)</td></tr><tr><td><input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(2)(iii)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> 50.36(c)(2)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(v)(A)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> 73.71(a)(4)</td></tr><tr><td><input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(2)(iv)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> 50.46(a)(3)(ii)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(v)(B)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> 73.71(a)(5)</td></tr><tr><td><input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(2)(v)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(i)(A)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(v)(C)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> OTHER</td></tr><tr><td><input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(2)(vi)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(i)(B)</td><td><input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(v)(D)</td><td>Specify in Abstract below or in NRC Form 366A</td></tr></table>								<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2201(b)	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(3)(i)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(i)(C)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(vii)	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2201(d)	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(3)(ii)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(ii)(A)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(viii)(A)	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(1)	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(4)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(ii)(B)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(viii)(B)	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(2)(i)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.36(c)(1)(i)(A)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(iii)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(ix)(A)	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(2)(ii)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.36(c)(1)(ii)(A)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(iv)(A)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(x)	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(2)(iii)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.36(c)(2)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(v)(A)	<input type="checkbox"/> 73.71(a)(4)	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(2)(iv)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.46(a)(3)(ii)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(v)(B)	<input type="checkbox"/> 73.71(a)(5)	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(2)(v)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(i)(A)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(v)(C)	<input type="checkbox"/> OTHER	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(2)(vi)
<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2201(b)	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(3)(i)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(i)(C)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(vii)																																								
<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2201(d)	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(3)(ii)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(ii)(A)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(viii)(A)																																								
<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(1)	<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(4)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(ii)(B)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(viii)(B)																																								
<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(2)(i)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.36(c)(1)(i)(A)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(iii)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(ix)(A)																																								
<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(2)(ii)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.36(c)(1)(ii)(A)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(iv)(A)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(x)																																								
<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(2)(iii)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.36(c)(2)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(v)(A)	<input type="checkbox"/> 73.71(a)(4)																																								
<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(2)(iv)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.46(a)(3)(ii)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(v)(B)	<input type="checkbox"/> 73.71(a)(5)																																								
<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(2)(v)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(i)(A)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(v)(C)	<input type="checkbox"/> OTHER																																								
<input type="checkbox"/> 20.2203(a)(2)(vi)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(i)(B)	<input type="checkbox"/> 50.73(a)(2)(v)(D)	Specify in Abstract below or in NRC Form 366A																																								
10. POWER LEVEL  100%																																											

**12. LICENSEE CONTACT FOR THIS LER**

## FACILITY NAME

Ashley Valone

## TELEPHONE NUMBER (Include Area Code)

843-857-1256

**13. COMPLETE ONE LINE FOR EACH COMPONENT FAILURE DESCRIBED IN THIS REPORT**

CAUSE	SYSTEM	COMPONENT	MANU-FACTURER	REPORTABLE TO EPIX	CAUSE	SYSTEM	COMPONENT	MANU-FACTURER	REPORTABLE TO EPIX
B	JB	JX	Ensign™	N					

**14. SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT EXPECTED**☐ YES (If yes, complete 15. EXPECTED SUBMISSION DATE)☒ NO**15. EXPECTED SUBMISSION DATE**

MONTH

DAY

YEAR

**ABSTRACT** (Limit to 1400 spaces, i.e., approximately 15 single-spaced typewritten lines)

At 2203 hours EST on November 6, 2009, with H. B. Robinson Steam Electric Plant, Unit No. 2, operating at approximately 100% power, control room operators responded to alarms received for steam flow greater than feed flow and level deviation on 'A' Steam Generator. Feed Regulating Valve, FCV-478, for 'A' Steam Generator indicated closed with controller demand of 0 percent. Control room operators attempted to manually open FCV-478. During this time, an increase in feed flow was noted. The 'A' Steam Generator level continued to lower to approximately 35 percent. The reactor was manually tripped at 2203 as the trip setpoint was approaching.

The event was caused by a premature failure of the flow error signal summator power supply for the 'A' Feed Regulating Valve Control Loop FC-478E. The summator power supply has been replaced and the loop was calibrated successfully. The condition is reportable in accordance with 10 CFR 50.73(a)(2)(iv)(A), any event or condition that resulted in manual or automatic actuation of any of the systems listed in 10 CFR 50.73(a)(2)(iv)(B).

**LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER)  
CONTINUATION SHEET**

1. FACILITY NAME	2. DOCKET	6. LER NUMBER			3. PAGE
H. B. Robinson Steam Electric Plant, Unit No. 2	05000261	YEAR	SEQUENTIAL NUMBER	REV. NO.	2 OF 4
		2009	- 003	- 00	

**NARRATIVE****I. DESCRIPTION OF EVENT**

At 2203 hours EST on November 6, 2009, with H. B. Robinson Steam Electric Plant (HBRSEP), Unit No. 2, operating at approximately 100% power, control room operators responded to alarms received for steam flow greater than feed flow and level deviation on 'A' Steam Generator (SG) [EII System:Component AB:SG]. Feed Regulating Valve [JB:FCV] FCV-478 for 'A' SG indicated closed with controller demand of 0 percent. Control room operators attempted to manually open FCV-478 in accordance with AOP-010, "Main Feedwater/Condensate Malfunction." During this time, an increase in feed flow was noted. The 'A' SG level continued to lower to approximately 35 percent. The reactor was manually tripped at 2203 as the trip setpoint of 30 percent was approaching.

The control room operators entered the appropriate post-trip procedures. The auxiliary feedwater system [BA] initiated during the event, as expected. Intermediate Range Nuclear Instrument System Detector [IG:DET], N-35, was noted to be spiking causing the power above Intermediate Range Neutron Flux, P-6 interlock, status light to come on periodically. The spiking on N-35 was attributed to a faulty power supply and was later replaced on November 8, 2009, prior to unit start up.

**II. CAUSE OF EVENT**

The cause of this event was determined to be due to a vendor design error that resulted in premature part failure in the power supply for the Feed Regulating Control Loop FC-478E. A causal factor that contributed to this event was a lack of documentation regarding design issues with the Ensign™ Power Supply-Revision 3 by the vendor.

**III. ANALYSIS OF EVENT**

The condition described in this Licensee Event Report is reportable under 10 CFR 50.73(a)(2)(iv)(A), any event or condition that resulted in manual or automatic actuation of any of the systems listed in 10 CFR 50.73(a)(2)(iv)(B).

This event was investigated using the HBRSEP, Unit No. 2, Corrective Action Program (CAP) and documented in Significant Adverse Nuclear Condition Report 364853. The significant adverse condition investigation associated with this reportable event was reviewed by the Plant Nuclear Safety Committee on December 22, 2009. The investigation determined that failure of the FC-478E summator power supply was due to a vendor design error that resulted in premature part failure in the power supply.

During the investigation, the extent of condition was evaluated for all modules with Ensign™ Power Supplies-Revision 3. There were 88 modules identified at HBRSEP, Unit No. 2. Of these 88, 78 are currently in operation. There are 10 modules where a failure in the power supply

LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER)  
CONTINUATION SHEET

1. FACILITY NAME	2. DOCKET	6. LER NUMBER			3. PAGE
H. B. Robinson Steam Electric Plant, Unit No. 2	05000261	YEAR	SEQUENTIAL NUMBER	REV. NO.	3 OF 4
		2009	- 003	- 00	

## NARRATIVE

could cause a plant transient or loss of control function. In addition, there are 34 modules where a failure in the power supply could cause the plant to be placed in a ½ trip condition. The remaining modules are for alarm and indication only.

The safety significance of this event is considered very low. The plant responded as designed and the operating crew manually tripped the reactor in response to the condition they observed. The auxiliary feedwater system initiated during the event, as expected. Therefore, this event posed negligible adverse safety consequences for the public or plant personnel.

## IV. CORRECTIVE ACTIONS

Completed Corrective Actions:

- FC-478E summator power supply was replaced with an Ensign™ Power Supply-Revision 4. Revision 4 does not contain the same capacitors in Revision 3 that caused the premature failure of the power supply. The channel was tested and restored to normal operation at 1752 hours EDT on November 7, 2009.
- Identified and located all HBRSEP, Unit No. 2, modules with Ensign™ Power Supplies-Revision 3 installed.
- Placed stock quantities of NUS modules and modules being prepared for installation that contain Ensign™ Power Supplies-Revision 3 "on-hold" to be returned to the vendor for replacement of the power supply.

Planned Corrective Actions:

- Replace modules in applications that have an Ensign™ Power Supply-Revision 3 where a blown fuse failure could result in a potential transient, loss of control function, or put the plant in a half trip condition. The module replacements are targeted for completion during the next refueling outage, which is currently scheduled to begin on April 17, 2010.

## V. ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

Failed Component Information:

The failed power supply was an Ensign™ Power Supply-Revision 3 contained in a Halliburton summator, Model Number MTH-800-05/05/05/05-07-08.

**LICENSEE EVENT REPORT (LER)  
CONTINUATION SHEET**

1. FACILITY NAME	2. DOCKET	6. LER NUMBER			3. PAGE
H. B. Robinson Steam Electric Plant, Unit No. 2	05000261	YEAR	SEQUENTIAL NUMBER	REV. NO.	4 OF 4
		2009	- 003	- 00	

**NARRATIVE**

Previous Similar Events:

Licensee Event Reports (LERs) for HBRSEP, Unit No. 2, were reviewed from the past 10 years. No events were identified that were similar to the event described in this LER.